



2011 History

Higher Paper 2

Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2011

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purposes written permission must be obtained from SQA's NQ Delivery: Exam Operations Team.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the centre's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance. SQA's NQ Delivery: Exam Operations Team may be able to direct you to the secondary sources.

These Marking Instructions have been prepared by Examination Teams for use by SQA Appointed Markers when marking External Course Assessments. This publication must not be reproduced for commercial or trade purposes.

**2011 History Higher
Paper 2
Marking Instructions**

Introduction

- 1 Marking is positive and relates to the points made.
- 2 For credit to be given, points must relate to the question asked.
- 3 If relevant evidence is selected, from the source but **no** evaluation is made then the maximum mark that may be achieved is 1 as this is considered to be listing. The same process applies to recalled information. This is reinforced in the guidance below.
- 4 For the marking of particular types of question, detailed guidance is given below

Source Evaluation items

How useful is Source A as evidence of... 5 marks

Feature of marking	Mark allocation	Mark given	Overall mark
Evaluation of Provenance	Up to 2 marks		
Evaluation of Content	Up to 2 marks		
Evaluation of relevant Recall	Up to 2 marks		

- Up to two marks may be given for points about ORIGIN and PURPOSE. At the basic level, this may be good CREDIT level approach, but this can only achieve one mark. For two marks to be given some explanation as to the importance of the origin and purpose is needed.
- The candidate can achieve up to two marks for their interpretation of the parts of source they consider are useful in terms of the proposed question. For full marks to be given each point needs to be discreetly mentioned and its usefulness explained. Listing can only be considered to be one point.
- The remaining marks, up to a maximum of two, are achieved by the application of relevant and developed recall that they provide. This has to be developed in terms of the question for full marks to be given.

Source Comparison items

To what extent do Sources B and C agree about... 5 marks

Feature of marking	Mark allocation	Mark given	Overall mark
Overall comparison	Up to 2 marks		
Direct comparisons	Up to 4 marks		

- The question has the more complex, 'To what extent...' style beginning, indicating that the overall evaluation is important. In other words, the candidate shows understanding of the views, rather than simply rehearsing content. This can gain up to two marks.
- Candidates are expected to compare content directly on a point by point basis, but this has to be more than a simple, A says, but B says... *Some basic explanation of what the two sources agree/disagree about, combined with illustration of the point from the sources is needed for a full mark to be given.* This allows for articulation from good practice at Standard Grade and Intermediate, while requiring a more sophisticated Higher level response.

Contextualisation items

These questions ask about a specific issue/sub-issue in the course, seeking to assess depth of knowledge.

How fully/far does Source D explained/illustrate/show...

10 marks

Feature of marking	Mark allocation	Mark given	Overall mark
Use of Source	Up to 4 marks		
Use of Relevant Recall	Up to 7 marks		

- The candidate can achieve up to four marks for their interpretation of the parts of the source they consider are relevant in terms of the proposed question. For full marks to be given each point needs to be discreetly mentioned in terms of the question. Merely selecting relevant information and/or listing can only be considered to be one point.
- The remaining marks, up to a maximum of seven, are achieved by the application of **relevant** and **developed** recall that they provide. This has to be **developed in terms of the question** for full marks to be given. Again, the quality of the response matters as does the relevance of the information. Points of recall may be developed from the source and/or be new points. The quality of both is comparable.

Annotation of Scripts when marking.

The following annotation should be used when marking.

Specifically identify when credit is being given by using the following symbols;

P: Provenance: covering both Origin and Purpose, when used appropriately.

S: Relevant point from source, when used appropriately.

R: Relevant point of recalled information, when used appropriately.

O/C: Relevant overall comparison point.

C: Valid, explained individual comparison point.

When you identify relevant points from Provenance, Source and Recall, BUT they are not being used correctly: i.e. they are listing information, use the same annotation, but surround with brackets like so:

(P)

(S)

(R)

(O/C)

(C)

SPECIAL TOPIC 1: THE WARS OF INDEPENDENCE, 1286 – 1328

Question 1: How useful is **Source A** as evidence of why the Scots asked Edward to resolve the succession crisis in Scotland? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how useful **Source A** is as evidence of why the Scots asked Edward to resolve the succession crisis in Scotland, in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin:** William Fraser, Bishop of St Andrews, the senior churchman in Scotland.
- **Possible purpose:** desire to avoid civil war by calling in independent, powerful neighbour; Fraser has also been accused of favouring Balliol's claim for the throne.
- **Content:**
 - A sad rumour reverberated among the people that our lady was dead, because of this the kingdom of Scotland is troubled and the community perplexed.
 - When the rumour was heard and published Sir Robert Bruce, who had not intended to come to the meeting came with a large retinue to confer with some who were there. Concern as his intentions are not known.
 - Fear of a general war and a large-scale slaughter unless the Most High, through your active involvement and good offices, administer a quick cure.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Maid of Norway, only direct surviving blood relation to the dead Alexander III had died on reaching Orkney causing the succession crisis.
- Fraser believes that Edward should come to an understanding with Balliol, and this is the only way to avoid civil war.
- The Earls of Mar and Atholl were also collecting their army, which further led to fear of civil war.
- Scots were looking for Edward I to arbitrate between the two competitors.
- Fear that the guardianship would collapse.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Alexander had had a good working relationship with Edward I of England.
- Edward I had a reputation as a statesman.
- Fraser's letter led to a reaction from the Bruce faction: letter of the seven earls.
- Balliol was also manoeuvring for the crown, he had established a close relationship with Bishop Bek, Edward's chief representative in Scotland.
- Desire of Edward to revive English claims of overlordship.
- The majority of Scots looked kindly on Edward's intervention, at least at the beginning.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 2: How fully does **Source B** illustrate the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source B** illustrates the relationship between John Balliol and Edward I:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Balliol was aware that he needed to impress Edward if he wanted to secure the kingdom.
- John's inauguration as King of Scots was attended by English officials rather than the traditional Scottish nobles and churchmen.
- John was summoned, more than once, to Northern England by Edward and crumbled in face of demand he renew his homage to Edward as overlord.
- Edward insisted he hear appeals from Scottish courts at Westminster.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Edward had decided that the Treaty of Birgham was no longer valid, since the marriage had not gone through; he demanded that John agree to this.
- It was only a week into his reign when the Burgesses of Berwick appealed to Edward over a court decision made by the Guardians, that John had upheld.
- Other appeals were quick in coming, such as the damaging Macduff case.
- Scottish kings were not used to being summoned to appear before an English court.
- Alexander III had refused to do homage for Scotland.
- John had to agree to some English members of his government.
- Edward forced John to release him of any promise he made about Scottish autonomy.
- John did try to resist but he backed down in the face of threats.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- In 1294 Edward ordered John to bring Scottish troops to fight for him in France.
- This angered the Scottish nobles who had good trading relations with France.
- Nobles elected a council of Guardians to help John stand up to Edward.
- John sent envoys to treat with the French king in 1295; this was formally ratified in 1296 after Edward's invasion.
- April 1296 John sent Edward a list of grievances with Edward's handling of the issue of overlordship, it has been suggested he was forced to do this by the guardians.
- John decided to submit to Edward hoping for leniency: he surrendered at Kincardine.
- From this John was brought before Edward at Brechin and ceremoniously stripped of his royal regalia, his surcoat stripped from his body.
- Here John earned his nickname from English soldiers, Toom Tabard.
- John was taken as a prisoner to London.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: To what extent do **Sources C** and **D** agree about the career of William Wallace? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on the extent to which **Sources C** and **D** agree about the career of William Wallace in terms of:

Overall **Sources C** and **D** both agree on Wallace about several events during his career. They agree that he started out as an outlaw, was defeated at Falkirk and was executed by Edward. However **Source C** paints Wallace in a very negative light demonstrating a lot of bias, whereas **Source D** offers a more balanced judgement of his career.

Source C

- Wallace was an outcast, robber and sacrilegious man. Wallace was a cruel robber who burnt churches and killed school boys.
- Wallace could not resist the power of the English army at Falkirk, and fled leaving his people to be slain.
- Wallace was taken prisoner by Edward's servants and taken to London.
- Wallace was executed, his head was placed on a stake on London Bridge and his body divided into four and sent to the 4 quarters of Scotland.

Source D

- Wallace became an outlaw because his father did not sign the Ragman Roll, and the Sheriff of Lanark killed his mistress.
- Wallace's army were worn down by knights and archers, but he escaped after making sure that he rescued the survivors of his army.
- Wallace was betrayed by Sir John Stewart of Mentieth.
- Wallace was put to death by being strangled and dismembered.

Question 4: How far does **Source E** show the opposition of many Scots to Robert Bruce? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source E** shows the opposition of many Scots to Robert Bruce in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- The letters, including the Declaration of Arbroath, were designed to show unity between the Scots in support of King Robert, but there were limits to this unity.
- Many lords did not like being associated with the letters because they had a deep distaste for Bruce's kingship which those letters championed.
- There was a rival claim by Edward Balliol, many Scottish nobles preferred his claim to the throne: Edward joined with Scots who had refused to enter Bruce's allegiance.
- Some nobles, including Agnes Comyn and William Soules conspired against Bruce.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Barbour claimed that Soules was trying to assassinate Bruce, but in reality the conspirators hoped for a Balliol restoration and peace with England.
- Bruce learned about the conspiracy and struck first, arresting the ring leaders and sentencing many to death.
- This conspiracy was a reminder that some Scots believed Bruce was an usurper.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Bruce alienated the powerful Comyn faction by murdering their chief, John "the Red" Comyn in 1306.
- Bruce forced to fight a civil war between 1306 and 1311 against the Comyns and their supporters.
- The Comyn family was defeated in the North East and Bruce brought fire and sword to the earldom of Buchan devastating the province for many years to come.
- Bruce's family had long been antagonists with other powerful West coast political powers, such as the MacDougalls.
- Bruce's bid for the throne saw the MacDougalls join his enemies.
- Bruce had held an armistice for many nobles at his Parliament in Cambuskenneth in 1314, but many had refused, they fled to England and forfeited their lands. These families became known as the Disinherited.
- Bruce forbade lords to have divided loyalties thus they could not swear an oath to Edward II for lands in England.
- Bruce was always willing to restore lands to the Disinherited, but they first had to swear loyalty to him.
- The issue that the lands of the Disinherited were given to favourites of Bruce. Perception that they were unfairly distributed.
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 2: THE AGE OF REFORMATION, 1542-1603

Question 1: How useful is **Source A** as evidence of the growth of Protestantism in Scotland before the Reformation of 1560? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how useful **Source A** is in showing evidence of the growth of Protestantism in Scotland before the Reformation in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Provenance:** Contemporary source written by a leading figure in the Reformation. Clearly biased and may have the benefit of hindsight.
- **Possible purpose:** To provide an account of the events surrounding the Reformation in Scotland and to encourage the new Protestant Church in Scotland.
- **Content:**
 - The death of Walter Myln increased fervour amongst the Protestants.
 - Perth was to become a Protestant town.
 - John Knox felt able to return to Scotland and openly preach in Perth.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- In the spring of 1559, Dundee and Perth declared themselves Protestant towns.
- Knox returned to Scotland and began preaching; causing a riot in Perth where religious houses were attacked.
- Knox had not been in Scotland at the time of Myln's death.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- There was a growing interest in Protestant ideas as Bibles and other literature arrived from Europe.
- Acts of Parliament were passed to protect the Catholic Church in Scotland which indicates that Protestant ideas were becoming a threat.
- Impact of the preaching tour of George Wishart.
- Confidence had grown amongst the Scots' Protestants after Elizabeth became Queen in England in 1558.
- By 1558 in some east coast burghs Protestant congregations were meeting and using the English Prayer book.
- The Beggars Summons – notices during winter of 1558-59 on Friary doors demanding that the Friars leave the friaries.
- Bonds had been entered into by some of the Scots' nobility.
- Scottish Protestant Lords organised themselves as the Lords of the Congregation.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 2: How fully does **Source B** explain why Mary, Queen of Scots lost her throne? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source B** explains why Mary, Queen of Scots lost her throne in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Bothwell was regarded as the main suspect in the murder of Darnley.
- Mary failed to mourn for Darnley which did not look good.
- The trial of Bothwell was to prove to be a farce.
- Her marriage to Bothwell was Protestant which appeared hypocritical.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Handbills went up in Edinburgh showing that popular opinion blamed Bothwell and implicated Mary.
- On the day of Bothwell's trial, Edinburgh was full of his armed supporters. This resulted in even Darnley's father, Lennox failing to give evidence.
- Catholics disappointed by Mary's actions; Mary did little to help the Catholic faith in Scotland.
- Marriage to Bothwell by Protestant rites alienated Catholics at home and abroad.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Mary had the difficult situation of being a Catholic monarch in a land which had become Protestant.
- Marriage to Darnley lost Mary the support of her half brother James Stewart, Earl of Moray and other nobles. This led to the Chase-about-raid.
- Mary made a poor choice of husband in Darnley. His life style and his craving for power proved to be an embarrassment.
- Lack of attendance by Mary at Council Meetings was a likely cause of the Rizzio murder. Nobles feeling neglected.
- Mary's apparent closeness to Bothwell before the murder of Darnley heightened suspicion of her involvement.
- Murder of Darnley was a major blow to Mary's position but she may have survived if she had acted properly.
- The marriage to Bothwell was regarded as scandalous. Bothwell had just recently had his own marriage annulled.
- Bothwell was not a popular figure with many of the nobles.
- A sizeable number of the Nobles felt strongly enough to form the Confederate Lords and rise to overthrow Mary.
- In 1567, Mary was forced to abdicate by the Lords of the Congregation.
- She abdicated in favour of her infant son, with Moray returning as Regent.
- In 1568, she escaped and raised troops but was defeated by Moray. This resulted in her escape to England.
- Mary naively hoped that Elizabeth would provide her with troops; instead she was imprisoned until her execution in 1587.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: To what extent do **Sources C** and **D** agree about James VI's attempts to control the Kirk? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Sources C** and **D** agree about James VI's attempts to control the Kirk in terms of:

Overall **Source C** agrees with **Source D** that King James used various methods to attempt to control the Kirk, although **Source C** also shows that the Kirk wished to control the doctrine of its ministers.

Source C

- General Assembly met at Perth as the King had requested.
- The King had the right to choose the date when the General Assembly would meet.
- In all the main towns ministers to be chosen by the congregation and the King.
- No minister was to criticise the King and no man's name was to be rebuked from the pulpit.

Source D

- General Assembly met at Perth rather than St Andrews as ministers in the north more likely to support the King./The King could choose the place where the Assembly met.
- No meeting to be held without the King's knowledge.
- Ministers in the main towns should not be appointed without the consent of the King.
- Restrictions were placed on ministers' sermons in particular commenting on politics and censuring individuals.

Question 4: How far does **Source E** explain the social impact of the Reformation on Scotland, to 1603?

(10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source E** explains the social impact of the Reformation on Scotland in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- The church sought to regulate the lives of everyone to an obsessive and unhealthy degree.
- Kirk Sessions aimed to regulate morals and manners to promote a godly society.
- People presumed guilty until proven innocent therefore a sizeable proportion of the population could expect to be before the session: example of St Andrews and number of cases of sexual misconduct.
- Elders policed their part of a parish and could even enter people's houses.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- From 1560 Kirk Sessions exercised the right of fining, imprisoning and excommunicating offenders against their authority in moral matters.
- 'Stool of repentance' used to chastise those who had broken the moral code. They would be rebuked in the presence of the congregation.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Great emphasis was laid upon attendance at both daily and Sunday services and every effort was made by Kirk Sessions to ensure that no possible diversions existed which might detain a congregation from their duties.
- Kirk Sessions enforced acts relating to the possession of Psalm Books and Bibles printed under the strict supervision of the General Assembly.
- Kirk Sessions were constantly occupied in their attempts to keep wedding and other celebrations within bounds.
- The observance of Festivals and Saint Days and the performance of plays were actively discouraged.
- From the 1570s increased Sabbatarianism.
- Increased interest in and persecution of witchcraft.
- Music and dancing were also at times actively discouraged.
- There were ambitious plans in the First Book of Discipline to provide for the poor from the revenues of the old church, but vested interests thwarted those ambitions and funds proved to be inadequate.
- Church distinguished between the deserving and the undeserving poor.
- The able-bodied poor were not to be helped nor were vagrants and unlicensed beggars; in fact they were often punished by whippings and branding.
- Poor relief was to be provided in the parish where you were born or lived in for some time.
- Those who were destitute were only allowed to beg in their own parish after being issued with a beggar's badge and becoming a licensed beggar or 'gaberlunzie'.
- Church collections and payments for use of parish mort cloth, as well as fines from those disciplined by the Church, were used for poor relief.
- Act of 1587 allowed magistrates to assess the inhabitants of the parish to provide for poor relief.
- Income for poor relief was always short of ideal.
- Kirk's efforts to extend Education had a major social impact as more Scots had a basic education. Although the aim to establish a school in every parish was slow to achieve.
- There was an increase in the numbers of universities in this period.
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 3: THE TREATY OF UNION, 1689-1740

Question 1: How useful is **Source A** as evidence of worsening relations between Scotland and England between 1690 and 1705? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how useful **Source A** is as evidence of worsening relations between Scotland and England in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin:** Speech given by Stair in Parliament during the union debates.
- **Possible purpose:** remind Scots of treatment by England during Darien/support an incorporating union.
- **Content:**
 - Scotland suffered from a lack of co-operation from England.
 - England treated Scots as pirates and enemy aliens, not fellow British subjects.
 - England encouraged Spain to attack the Scots' colony.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- King William objected to Darien as it threatened English trade.
- William influenced many English investors to withdraw from the Company, antagonised many Scots.
- William persuaded the Dutch to refuse to sell ships to the Scots.
- East India Company stopped foreign investment in Company of Scotland.
- William instructed English colonists in Jamaica not to offer help to the Scots.
- William was influenced by English foreign policy towards Spain and France.
- No security for Scotland from Union of the Crowns.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- King William firmly controlled Scotland to reduce threat of Jacobite rebellion.
- Glencoe Massacre (in which Stair himself had been complicit).
- England's war with France affected English dealings with Scotland.
- Jacobite plot to assassinate William further strained relations.
- Continued effects on trade of English Navigation Acts of the 1660s.
- Issues concerning the succession – Act of Settlement (England).
- Act of Security (Scotland) – threat to restore the Stuarts.
- Wool Act and Wine Act in Scotland.
- Alien Act in England threatening Scottish trade with England.
- Consequence of 1688-89 Revolution: Scottish Parliament – no longer willing to 'rubber stamp' decisions taken in England.
- Scotland's economic problems – seven ill years, no help from England.
- England's fear that France may use Scotland as 'back door' – threat of invasion.
- Influence of the English Court on Scottish government – Queen Anne would employ only those who would support the Hanoverian Succession.
- Distrust existing between Episcopalian Church and Presbyterian Church of Scotland.
- Captain Green executed in Leith.
- Covenanters still agitating for Covenant of 1638 to be observed.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 2: How fully does **Source B** illustrate the arguments for and against the Treaty of Union?

(10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source B** illustrates the arguments for and against the Treaty of Union in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Scotland would become a province of England.
- Subjection of Scotland: Cornwall would send almost as many members to Parliament as whole of Scotland.
- Scots wanted to remain known as Scots and not British.
- Scotland had fought for honour as a nation and was recognised by foreign countries.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- The creation of 'Scotlandshire' was a genuine fear for opponents of union.
- 45 Scots MPs in the House of Commons was felt to be under-representation.
- Many cherished what Lord Belhaven called 'Mother Caledonia'.
- Opponents of union wanted Scotland to remain an independent nation.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

Arguments against union

- British parliament would favour English trade over Scottish.
- Fear of loss of European trade.
- Royal burghs would be deprived of rights.
- Manufactures may be ruined.
- English currency, weights and measures might be introduced.
- Presbyterians feared a British parliament dominated by Anglican church with bishops' seats in the House of Lords.
- Fears of reduction in status of Scottish nobility in British parliament.
- Scots Episcopalians opposed union and Hanoverian succession – only Stuart dynasty might restore episcopacy to Scottish church.
- Fear of taxes
- Fear of taking on English debt
- Possible ruin of Scottish manufactures and economy

Arguments for union

- Advantages in commerce and trade.
- Economy would improve – national product would increase.
- Scotland's trade would catch up with other European nations'/Free trade with English colonies.
- Protection of being in Great Britain.
- Common interests already with England.
- Advantages of Scottish politicians being part of the court of the king in London.
- Hanoverian succession offered security to Protestantism thus reducing threat from Popery: compared with Edict of Nantes and persecution of Huguenots.
- Union reduced risk of war.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: To what extent do **Sources C** and **D** agree about the reasons for the passing of the Treaty of Union? (5)

Overall **Source C** and **Source D** agree that the Squadrone and political management were reasons for the passing of the Treaty of Union, but they differ on the importance of the Equivalent.

Source C

- Squadrone had key role in outcome of union vote.
- The Equivalent was crucial in carrying the treaty.
- The Equivalent was an inducement to the Squadrone Volante.
- Formidable political management machine of Court Party.

Source D

- Squadrone votes proved critical in securing approval for several articles.
- The Equivalent did not bribe MPs – support for union depended on more than material gain.
- Eight of Squadrone did not benefit from government patronage.
- Court's success achieved by political management.

Question 4 How far does **Source E** explain the economic effects of the Union up to 1740? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source E** explains the economic effects of the Union in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Free trade only brought prosperity to a few.
- Most enterprising Scots after 1707 were smugglers or black marketers.
- Manufactures not swamped but only sluggish demand from England and colonies.
- Insignificant effects on agriculture.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- In the years immediately after 1707, the economic disadvantages severely outweighed the advantages; only by 1740 were the benefits becoming apparent.
- Only a small number of Scots engaged successfully with the colonies.
- Increased taxes and duties encouraged smuggling and black market.
- It was difficult for some industries to cope with English competition.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Tobacco industry developed in Glasgow, but this was still in its infancy by 1740.
- Agricultural techniques improved.
- Increased investment in Scotland.
- 1727 – Royal Bank of Scotland founded.
- Board of Trustees for the Encouragement of Fisheries and Manufactures established.
- Paper industry failed.
- Scottish linen industry suffered in relation to English woollen industry.
- Merchant shipping benefited, particularly in trade with Baltic nations and the Caribbean.
- Trade with France was lost.
- Union forced many to emigrate.
- Increase in cattle trade in the Highlands.
- Malt Tax – resulted in increased cost of alcohol.
- Salt Tax – impact on fish curing industry.
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 4: MIGRATION AND EMPIRE, 1830–1939

Question 1: How useful is **Source A** as evidence of the reasons for Scottish migration and emigration? (5)

The candidate makes a judgment on how useful **Source A** is as evidence of the reasons for Scottish migration and emigration in terms of:

Points from source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- **Origin:** Primary source; views of an emigration agent representing Canada.
- **Possible purpose:** to highlight a problem in attracting emigrants to Canada.
- **Content:**
 - Emigration Agencies actively working to attract emigrants.
 - New Zealand and Australian authorities work is widespread, offering free passages and other inducements and diverting potential recruits from Canada.
 - Newspapers also push their cause as they gain revenue from their advertisements.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Domineering landlords and lack of real opportunities encouraged emigration from the Highlands of Scotland.
- Inducements offered by foreign lands eg free land in Canada.
- Use of free and assisted passages by many territories to encourage Scottish emigrants eg to both agricultural and urban workers.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- The Highland Problem.
- The Highland Clearances.
- Failure of the kelp and herring industries.
- Effects of the Agricultural Revolution on farming and employment.
- Effects of Industrial Revolution on craftsmen.
- Sub-division of land into crofts.
- Harsh employment conditions on the land.
- Government schemes to assist emigration eg Highland and Islands Emigration Society.
- Transport Revolution ie from sail to steam ships.
- Attractions of the 'big city' – employment, better wages, easier work.
- Discovery of gold in the USA.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 2: How fully does **Source B** illustrate the experience of immigrants in Scotland?

(10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source B** illustrates the experience of immigrants in Scotland in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Members of Catholic Irish communities were involved – often in significant numbers – in strikes, trades unions and trades unions’ campaigns.
- This participation was both welcomed and sought by Scottish workers.
- Most of the (sectarian) incidents did not involve Scottish workers, but were instead ‘Orange’ and ‘Green’ disturbances involving Protestant Irish and Catholic Irish immigrants.
- Most Scottish workers remained aloof and let the immigrant groups continue their old battles.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- In the 1830s and 1840s many Scots were repelled by the poverty and disease of Irish immigrants, Catholic and Protestant alike.
- Riots by Scottish workers from the 1820s to 1850s were not sectarian in nature but directed against the activities of Irish strike-breakers (both Catholic and Protestant) and confined almost exclusively to Lanarkshire and Ayrshire.
- Mixed marriages between Catholics and Protestants became commoner as the century progressed, particularly in smaller communities where the choice of marriage partners was less.
- The Catholic church took steps to develop Catholic organisations and institutions (eg Celtic FC) to develop a distinct Catholic community.
- Pius X’s ‘Ne Temere’ decree of 1908 on invalid marriages applied to every marriage of a Catholic, even when marrying someone who was not of his or her faith; this caused much heartache amongst non-Catholics who felt they were continually ‘losing out’.
- The 1918 Education Act led to increasingly separate communities in religious terms.
- In the 1920s the Church of Scotland became overtly hostile to Roman Catholicism.
- As the Scottish economy collapsed in the 1920s and 1930s, workplace discrimination against Catholics grew.
- In the 1920s and 1930s a few anti-Catholic councillors were successful in local elections in Glasgow and Edinburgh (though many lost their seats at the first defence).
- Anti-Catholic (rather than anti-Irish) disturbances in Edinburgh in 1935 were condemned by the press and punished by the courts.
- The Protestant Irish assimilated more easily into Scottish society, but at the expense of their distinct identity.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Lithuanian immigrants were largely employed in the coal industry; they changed their names to integrate more easily into Scottish society.
- Lithuanians were much fewer in numbers than Irish immigrants and not perceived as a threat to Scottish way of life by native Scots.
- Italians were accepted into Scottish society fairly readily, providing a service through cafes etc. Italians kept own identity through clubs and organisations.
- Italians suffered hostility in the years before World War II as concerns grew about Mussolini's actions.
- Jews settled in central Glasgow, typically setting up small businesses. As they prospered they moved to more affluent suburbs.
- Most immigrant groups suffered minor harassment at various times, both from native Scots and from other immigrant groups.
- Immigrants often settled initially in the poorest areas of towns and cities; in the nineteenth century this meant they suffered from deprivation in overcrowded slums.
- Immigrants in Glasgow particularly suffered alongside the poorer sections of native society from the epidemics of mid-century.
- By the 1890s, both Catholic and Protestant Irish were gaining apprenticeships and beginning to move up the social ladder.
- The First World War and the ensuing slumps led to the collapse of the Scottish economy; this prevented further upward social mobility to a large extent. It also meant there was little further immigration, so that those near the foot of the social structure tended to stay there.
- Any other relevant factors.

Question 3: To what extent do **Sources C** and **D** agree about the contribution of Scots to the economic growth and development of the Empire? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Sources C** and **D** agree about the contribution of Scots to the economic growth and development of the Empire in terms of:

Overall: **Source C** and **Source D** agree that emigrant Scots made a significant and positive contribution to the growth and economic development of the Empire, but while **Source C** is totally positive in the view, **Source D** adds a note of caution that some Scots made a less than positive contribution to their adopted land although the numbers are relatively few.

Developed through detail:

Source C

- Scots have played important roles in the economic development of New Zealand.
- Scots noted for their contribution to education, the first high school for girls in Otago opened in 1871 due to the efforts of a Scot.
- Scots were strongly over-represented among those involved in health matters.
- Otago had strong links with the Edinburgh medical school and Scots-born people had a continuing impact in the scientific field.

Source D

- Enterprise of the Dunedin merchants has done much for the commerce and prosperity of Otago.
- The Scot has made his mark in the field of education, setting up schools in the area.
- Several of the Scots' descendants became doctors administering to the health of the local population.
- A Scot founded the Geological Survey Of New Zealand and managed New Zealand's premier scientific society.

Question 4: How far does **Source E** show the importance of Empire to Scotland's development?

(10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how **Source E** shows the importance of Empire to Scotland's development, in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Empire enabled some firms and individuals to make great commercial fortunes.
- Empire offered opportunities of employment to the sons of the ascendant Scottish middle-class.
- Example of Jute trade: raw material came from the Indian province of Bengal. The textile manufactured from this imported good was subsequently exported all over the world.
- Heavy industries of Scotland exported a high proportion of their products. American grain might well be taken in sacks made in Dundee, by locomotives manufactured in Springfield near Glasgow, to be loaded onto ships built on the Clyde.

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Exemplification of firms and individuals who made fortunes, such as Clyde shipbuilders like Napier's, John Brown's and Beardmore's.
- Scotland exported to the Empire in great quantities: Springburn, produced one quarter of the world's locomotives in 1914.
- Scots exploited employment opportunities offered by Empire: Scottish middle-class boys had successful careers, especially in India, as civil servants, doctors and as soldiers.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Scottish investors pioneer use of 'investment trusts' where professional managers enabled large numbers of modest investors to gain access to the rewards of large-scale investment. Cities like Edinburgh, Dundee and Aberdeen came to hold extensive investments abroad.
- Investment a double-edged sword as it also meant that capital left Scotland to finance projects abroad.
- Importance of commerce and Empire left Scotland vulnerable to international trade slumps.
- Low-wage economy encouraged in Scotland by export market led to considerable poverty for many with associated problems of poor housing, etc.
- Empire also allowed for the development of a skilled, literate working class in engineering, etc.
- Empire encouraged Scottish martial tradition: eg; Sir Charles Napier and Sir Colin Campbell in India.
- Any other relevant points.

SPECIAL TOPIC 5: THE IMPACT OF THE GREAT WAR, 1914 — 1928

Question 1: How useful is **Source A** as evidence of the experience of Scots on the Western Front? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement as to how useful **Source A** is as evidence of the experience of Scots on the Western Front in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

Origin:

- By Private Thomas McCall who fought in the assault at the Battle of Loos with the Cameron Highlanders. Useful as source is personal eyewitness account of the battle that became known as 'the Scottish battle'. The source also seems to be uncensored given the gory nature of content.

Possible Purpose:

- It was a record of what had occurred at the assault on Loos by a soldier of the Cameron Highlanders.

From source:

- Soldiers experienced fear of injury – “My God, I’m done for”.
- Soldiers experienced camaraderie – “he lifted his wounded pal’s kilt then gave a laugh.”
- Soldiers experienced combat – “machine guns were raking the street and bayonet fighting was going on”.

Distracter – details of hand-to-hand fighting or were the Jocks dealing with prisoners?

Points from recall which support and develop those in the source:

- Military tradition of Scots: kilted regiments considered to be good soldiers.
- Scots contribution to battle of Loos: deserves to be called a Scottish battle owing to the large number of Scottish troops in action. 30,000 took part in the attack.
- One third of British casualties were Scottish at Loos.
- Loos was first taste of action for Kitchener’s New Army volunteers.
- The 9th and 15th Scottish Divisions were to be involved in the attack.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Experience of Scots in Trenches: conditions such as trench foot, rats, etc.
- Experience of fighting and its effects: bombardment, shellshock, etc.
- Battle of the Somme: 3 Scottish divisions 9th, 15th [Scottish] and 51st [Highland] took part as well as numerous Scottish battalions in other units: ie the Scots Guards in the Household Division. 51 Scottish infantry battalions took part in the Somme offensive at some time.
- Battle of Arras: Saw concentration of 44 Scottish battalions and 7 Scottish named Canadian battalions, attacking on the first day, making it the largest concentration of Scots to have fought together.
- One third of British casualties were Scottish at Arras.
- Role in other battles, such as Cambrai and Third Ypres.
- Experience of Scottish women on Western Front: Scottish Ambulance Unit, etc as balance in question that asks only about “Scots on Western Front”.
- Scots in leadership role: eg Douglas Haig.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 2: How fully does **Source B** show the impact of war on Scottish society? (10)

The candidate makes a judgement on how fully **Source B** shows the impact of war on Scottish society in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- Scottish recruitment was a “higher percentage than any other country in UK”.
- “Scottish forces suffered disproportionately higher losses”.
- “Wartime revolutionised the position of women in the economy”.
- “The slaughter remained to haunt the nation”.

Points from recall that support and develop those in the source:

Recruitment

- Recruitment and Conscription: By the end of the first week in September 1914, Glasgow was able to boast that it had recruited more than 22,000 men.
- By December 1914, 25% of the male labour force of western Scotland had already signed up.
- 13% of those who volunteered in 1914-15 were Scots.
- Young Scots urged to join the army through a mixture of peer pressure, feelings of guilt, appeals to patriotism, hopes for escapism and adventure, heroism, self sacrifice and honour. For the unemployed, the army offered a steady wage.
- Kitchener's campaign was a huge success: examples such as by the end of August 20,000 men from the Glasgow area had joined up.
- In Scotland there were no official 'Pals Battalions' but in reality – the Highland Light Infantry/Tramway battalion; the 16th battalion/the Boys Brigade.
- In Edinburgh, Cranston's battalion and McCrae's battalions became part the Royal Scots. McCrae's battalion was the most famous because of its connection with Hearts football club.

Casualty rates

- The official figure given at the end of the war calculated that Scotland had suffered 74,000 dead.
- Huge sacrifice of Scots during the war: of 557,000 Scots who enlisted in the services, 26.4% lost their lives. One in five British casualties were Scottish.
- Campaigners for a national war memorial claimed the figure was over one hundred thousand.

Women in Wartime economy

- Shift towards military and manufacturing employment and a temporary decline in some service industries.
- Number of women working increased from 593,210 in 1911 and 638,575 a decade later.
- Before the war less than 4,000 women worked in heavy industry in Scotland.
- Number of women employed in munitions in Scotland rose to 31,500 by October 1918.
- Many women workers were used for “dilution” of labour.
- Women worked as conductors on trams and buses, as typists and secretaries and nearly 200,000 women found work in government departments.

Remembrance

- Collective national grief in Scotland.
- Also great pride in the achievement of the Scottish units.
- Local memorials were erected around the country.
- Scots wanted their own memorial in tribute to their special sacrifice: Edinburgh castle houses the memorial and museum. It was officially opened in 1928. Over 148,000 Scottish names are carved on the national war memorial.
- The British Legion was set up and in 1921 the British Legion Scotland. Poppy day started at the same time. The act of silence at 11am on 11 November started in 1919.

Points from recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Pacifism and Conscientious Objectors: People objected for religious, ethical or political reasons.
- DORA took industries, communications and resources under direct Government control, censorship of the press, imprisonment of war protestors, civilians could be tried under court martial, reduced hours of public houses etc.
- Rent Strikes saw a prominent role played by women like Mary Barbour, Helen Crawford and Agnes Dollan.
- These women would even physically oppose evictions and won with the passing of the Rent Restriction Act freezing rent levels and introducing state intervention in the private housing rental market for the first time.
- Any other relevant points.

Question 3: To what extent do **Sources C** and **D** agree about the economic effect of the war on Scotland? (5)

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Sources C** and **D** agree about the economic effects of the war on Scotland in terms of:

Overall: **Sources C** and **D** broadly agree on the economic effects of the war on Scottish industries such as shipping, coal, jute and farming, although there are difference in the detail between the sources.

Developed through detail:

Source C

- The Clyde in 1913 launched 750,000 tons of shipping but by the end of the 1920s the Clyde was launching merely 56,000 tons of shipping.
- In 1913 Scotland employed 140,000 miners but 20 years later the coal industry was...producing a third less coal.
- The Dundee jute trade was deeply depressed.
- In the late 1920s the value of Scottish farming was falling.

Source D

- Between 1921 and 1923 shipbuilding on the Clyde dropped (and) the Clyde was already beginning to pay for the artificial boom which had rescued it during the war years.
- Coal production suffered.
- Jute production in Dundee was adversely affected by declining orders.
- According to the Board (of Agriculture) the decline was not restricted to any particular part of the country but was widespread throughout Scotland.

Question 4: How far does **Source E** explain the reasons for the growth of radicalism in politics in Scotland? **(10)**

The candidate makes a judgement on how far **Source E** explains reasons for the growth of radicalism in politics in Scotland in terms of:

Points from the source which show the candidate has interpreted the significant views:

- The most decisive feature was the collapse of Liberalism as an effective electoral force.... Among the working classes the Labour party was most likely to benefit from Liberal misfortunes.
- The rent strike had increased the prestige and influence of ILP.
- Labour also excelled in organisation. The focus was constantly on local issues.
- Labour gained the lion's share of the new post 1918 electorate.

Points from recall which support those in the source:

- Liberal Party split between Asquith's independent Liberals and Lloyd George's coalition Liberals.
- The Liberal government was blamed for being incompetent in its handling of the war.
- Liberal government blamed by working class for introducing dilution, passing legislation to regulate work practices, arresting strike leaders and initially supporting landlords when they raised rents.
- Arguments within the party weakened its organisation and demoralised party workers. Party funds collapsed as members stopped paying subscriptions.
- Coupon Election.
- By 1924 the Liberals had only 8 MPs in Scotland.
- The Rent Strike did much to improve the credibility of the labour movement.
- Independent Labour Party instrumental in orchestrating and organising demonstrations.
- ILP supported workers grievances over prices and rents.
- Focus (of Labour party) was constantly on local issues of housing, rents and jobs. Both the ILP and the Labour party campaigned for reforms in housing and health after the war and their focus on local issues was a big reason for Labour's success in the 1920s.
- Effect of franchise reform of 1918 which almost trebled the size of the electorate from 779,000 in 1910 to 2,205,000 in 1918.
- By giving the vote to men on the basis of age then almost inevitably the new voters would come from the poorer sections of society and would be more likely to vote for the working class party representing their best interests – the Labour Party.

Points from Recall which offer a wider contextualisation such as:

- Catholic Irish vote deserted the Liberals and moved towards the Labour Party.
- Extension of the franchise to women. Many working class women had become politicised by their war work and the rent strikes. Women, such as Mary Barbour, Agnes Dollan and Helen Crawford became role models for women keen to make their voice heard politically for the first time.
- The effect of political developments such as the ILP and Red Clydeside.
- The Clyde Workers Committee (CWC) was formed to control and organise action for an extension of workers' control over industry.
- Papers like "Forward" and "Worker" suppressed.
- Influence of John MacLean, Willie Gallacher, Jimmy Maxton, John Muir, Tom Bell and Jock Smith. MacLean won the support of thousands of people with his socialist and anti war views.
- Forty Hours Strike and demonstration at George Square, waving of red flag, riot, troops and tanks appear on streets of Glasgow.
- In 1922 Labour won 29 seats in Scotland (10 in Glasgow) and then in 1924 they won 34 seats but saw this fall to 26 seats in second election in 1924 but in the same election the Liberals had fallen to 9 seats in Scotland.
- Any other relevant points.

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]